

Wolf-Ekkehard Lönning

Cologne, 3 October 2019

Nachtrag und Korrektur zum Beitrag: *Genesisperioden und Paläontologie* Inwieweit stimmt die Reihenfolge überein?

<http://www.weloennig.de/GenesisPalaeontologie.pdf>:

Aus der Korrespondenz mit einem jungen Mann (S. R.) und mehreren zu dieser Frage kompetenten Hebräisch-Kennern (siehe unten) (2019):

W.-E. L. an S. R.: Nun zurück zu Deiner Frage: "In der Bibel steht, dass die Vögel vor den Landtieren also somit auch Dinosaurier erschaffen wurden: gibt es wirklich Beweise, dass die Vögel vor den Dinosaurier gelebt haben?"

Beim nochmaligen Checken der Bibeltexte und der Daten ist mir noch Folgendes aufgefallen:

Die meisten Bibelübersetzungen sprechen zwar von der Erschaffung der Vögel am 5. Schöpfungstag (so die Luther-Übersetzung ["Vögel sollen fliegen auf Erden...], Pattloch ["Vögel am Himmelsgewölbe...], Elberfelder ["und Gevögel fliege über der Erde...], Zürcher Bibel ["Vögel sollen fliegen über der Erde..."] und viele, viele weitere Übersetzungen.

Die Neue-Welt-Übersetzung ist jedoch genauer, wenn sie folgendes schreibt (1986, Auflage 2007): "...und fliegende Geschöpfe mögen an der Vorderseite der Ausdehnung der Himmel über der Erde fliegen." Und 2018: "...und fliegende Tiere sollen über der Erde in der Himmelsausdehnung fliegen....Und Gott erschuf ... jedes Tier, das Flügel hat und fliegen kann, nach seiner Art."

Wenn man nun zu jedem Tier, "das Flügel hat und fliegen kann" auch die Flugsaurier zählt, kommt man mit den ältesten Flugsauriern gemäß der heutigen (wenn auch fragwürdigen) evolutionstheoretischen Zeitrechnung in die Obertrias (vor 228 Millionen Jahren), fast so alt wie die ganze Gruppe der Dinosaurier selbst (ca. 230 Millionen Jahre). [Weiterer Nachtrag: Die Zeitangaben schwanken:

"Die Fossilien der *ältesten unzweifelhaften Dinosaurier Eoraptor und Herrerasaurus* entstammen der etwa 230 Millionen Jahre (späte Trias) alten Ischigualasto-Formation in Argentinien." <https://de.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dinosaurier> "They first appeared during the Triassic period, between 243 and 233.23 million years ago, although *the exact origin and timing of the evolution of dinosaurs is the subject of active research*. They became the dominant terrestrial vertebrates after the Triassic–Jurassic extinction event 201 million years ago;" <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dinosaur>]

Zur Zeitrechnung möchte ich jedoch daran erinnern, dass gemäß C14 Datierung völlig andere Zeiträume zu veranschlagen sind: <http://newgeology.us/presentation48.html> (dort auch alle Quellenangaben), also allesamt der unten aufgeführten Dinosaurier zwischen 22280 und 32000 Jahre.

[Nachtrag: Mit diesem Hinweis möchte ich zu bedenken geben, dass das letzte Wort zum Thema Zeitrechnung noch nicht gesprochen ist – Siehe dazu auch C. Rupe und J. Sandford sowie R. Lewin zu einer erstaunlichen Korrektur zur KBS Tuff¹ controversy), zitiert auf den Seiten 27/28 in <http://www.weloennig.de/HumanEvolution.pdf>²]

¹ Kay Behrensmeyer Site Tuff.

²Conclusion: "I must admit that I am impressed: If it is possible to re-date 5 independently obtained 'accurate' ages from 2.6 Ma [exactly 2.61 ±0. 26 Ma by the Ar/Ar dating; a method that "would result in this tuff being incontrovertibly dated and with greater accuracy than any other site in Africa or elsewhere"] down to 1.8 Ma (applying the same dating methods) *to accommodate the ages to a preconceived evolutionary hypothesis* on the origin of humans – to emphasize: a difference of 0.8 Ma= 800,000 years (!) – how sure can we be that such old and new age determinations of all the Ma are really correct? See also the enormous age differences given for *Homo floresiensis* highest numbers [i.e. each the highest numbers of the age determinations]: 4,000 years, 92,000 yrs, 190,000 yrs and 700,000 yrs."

Wenn man weiter zu jedem Tier, "das Flügel hat und fliegen kann" auch die Insekten zählt, dann kommt man z. B. mit den Libellen nach evolutionstheoretischer Zeitrechnung (Meine Abkürzung im Folgenden: eZ) schon auf das Oberkarbon (ca. 300 Millionen Jahre): Dort: "Flügelspannweite von, je nach Rekonstruktion, 66 bis zu 70 Zentimeter"

Siehe: <https://de.wikipedia.org/wiki/Libellen>

Zurück zu Deiner Frage: "...gibt es wirklich Beweise, dass die Vögel [oder jetzt im weiteren Sinne: Tiere, die Flügel hatten und fliegen konnten] vor den Dinosaurier gelebt haben?"

Die ältesten Dinosaurierfunde werden zurzeit nach eZ auf ca. 243 Millionen Jahre datiert, also gab es schon 57 Millionen Jahre vor den Dinosauriern Tiere, die Flügel hatten und fliegen konnten.

Dazu ist sicher noch mehr zu forschen und zu sagen.

P. S. Es wäre jetzt natürlich ungeheuer interessant, solche C14 Daten auch für eine Serie von fossilen Vögeln und Säugetieren zu haben. Mir ist allerdings nicht bekannt, dass solche Untersuchungen schon systematisch durchgeführt worden sind,

Meine Frage an eine Gruppe von Hebräisch-Kennern

I have a question on Genesis 1:21 and 22 concerning the terms "flying creatures" and "every winged flying creature":

NWT (2013): Then God said: "Let the waters swarm with living creatures, and let flying creatures fly above the earth across the expanse of the heavens." And God created the great sea creatures and all living creatures that move and swarm in the waters according to their kinds and every winged flying creature according to its kind. And God saw that it was good.

NW (1984): And God went on to say: "Let the waters swarm forth a swarm of living souls and let flying creatures fly over the earth upon the face of the expanse of the heavens." And God proceeded to create the great sea monsters and every living soul that moves about, which the waters swarmed forth according to their kinds, and every winged flying creature according to its kind. And God got to see that [it was] good.

Most other translations speak (only) of birds.

What do the Hebrew terms for "flying creatures" and "every winged flying creature" include?

Also insects, pterosaurs, bats?

Answers

S. G.: "The Hebrew translated word at Genesis 1 is "oph". It can mean bird, but it can also include insects as well. The same Hebrew word is used at Leviticus 11:23, and verse 20.

The insight book, under Birds, also brings out that this word can include insects. So it makes sense to me why the brothers at headquarters did not translate it bird, but flying creatures because it can include insects as well.

Finally, this is just my thinking on the matter, but it would seem to me that Jehovah also created the great dinosaurs that lived in the water and those that flew as well during that time.

Now why do I say this? Because they were all created during the 5th creative day, and our study on the word day in the bible can mean a long period of time. This could have been thousands if not millions of years long, no one knows exactly how long these days were.

We also need to remember that the other animals, as well as Adam and Eve were not created till the 6th day, so there may have been a very long period of time between the 5th and 6th day, before humans walked the Earth.”

R. F.: “I have the following comments regarding "flying creatures."

My translation of Genesis 1:21, 22 is:

20 And God said, “Let the water swarm with living souls that move, and let flying creatures fly above the earth across the expanse of the heaven.”21 And God created the great creatures of the sea and all the living souls that crawl and swarm in the water, and every winged flying creature after its kind. And God saw that it was good. 22 And God blessed them and said, “Be fruitful and become many and fill the water in the seas, and let the flying creatures become many on the earth.”

The expression "winged flying creature" is translated from 'of [oph] flying creature" and kanaf ("wing"). It can refer to any creature with wings, including insects (Leviticus 11:20, 21), flying reptiles, and bats.

The creation occurred on the fifth day, and the fact that the words can refer to all kinds of winged flying creatures does not mean that all these creatures were created at the same time.

Small insects are found in Cambrian and Pre-Cambrian rocks in Pakistan and other places. This was long before the fifth day. These insects are very small and need not be included in the word 'of. But some insects are included, as seen above.

Moreover, vegetation was created on the third day, and that requires that insects already existed on the third day. But evidently, these are not included in the word 'of.”

S. W.: “Dear XY, I just got your post in response to Wolf's question and perhaps my response has arrived to you. I see that we agree that "all winged flying creatures" is a broad inclusive category.

You might be interested in the article at <https://wol.jw.org/en/wol/d/r1/lp-e/101991405> which bears on the progressive nature of the creation involving flying things.

I learned from that Bible's Viewpoint article that there is reason to believe that although one broad category of creature began to be created during different "days" apparently their creation may well have continued after that "day" was finished.

The article says "Genesis 2:19 seems to point to progressive creation involving flying creatures, for it states: “Yahweh God continued to form from the ground all the beasts of the field and all the birds [“every flying creature,” NW] of the heavens and to bring them to the man to see what he would call them.”—Watts, italics ours.”

Also S. W.:

“I had the same question. The articles g91 6/8 pp. 12-15 Did Each Creative Day Always Finish What It Started?, w87 1/15 p. 23 Insight on the News "a gap in evolution", g82 12/22 p. 19 A Fascinating Relationship, and w54 1/15 pp. 62-63 Questions From Readers (regarding "kind") helped me find an answer.

The FDS pointed out that God is said to have

1) "continued" to bring fourth certain broad categories of creatures starting in one "day" and extending into later "days"

2) that these broad categories included great reptiles in the sea and insects in the air

3) the only factor limiting diversity was the "kind" boundary.

As far as I understand it, the Hebrew says kal-ouf / canaf (כל-עוף כנף) "all winged" or "all which are covered [with wings]" / "flyers" and is translated every-winged / flying creature.

This is a better translation then "fowls" or "birds". כל-עוף כנף allows for all things that fly to be included in this category made up of various "kinds".

I take it to mean that once the atmosphere and landing places were suitable for the maintenance of life and reproduction certain kinds of creatures began to be created such as flying reptiles and insects. Later it became suitable for birds to exist (once the insects were small enough for them to consume) and at that point or later it would have been possible for bats to also make a living in the air. Although I can not be dogmatic this works for me, conceptually.

The Hebrew למינהם "according to their kinds" may be literally "to their portion" or "apportioned to them" or species (in the old meaning). This caused me to research the different taxonomic systems that have been proposed as they relate to the Biblical "kind". I have found absolutely no taxonomic definition for "kind" so I simply take it to mean the members of a category of life that can or could reproduce among themselves.

As for taxonomy, I find that life is almost endlessly categorizable - by appearance, mode of life, physical features, body configuration, body type, and now by genetics.

To me למינהם means a broad category of life and I leave it at that.

My answer to the question "What do the Hebrew terms for "flying creatures" and "every winged flying creature" include?" is "every living thing that flies"."

M.: We see ourselves that no such exception [birds] was given by restricting it to the avian. No statement was made [to] that effect. That does not rule out that the flying insect was created before the avian. We are witnesses to all their existence, either presently, or as an extinct representation. I see no restriction merited in particular.

W.-E. L.: In *Was Life Created?* the footnote (last sentences below) seems to be especially revealing for things occurring on the following "day":

“A careful consideration of the Genesis account reveals that events starting during one “day” continued into one or more of the following “days.” For example, before the first creative “day” started, light from the already existing sun was somehow prevented from reaching the earth’s surface, possibly by thick clouds. (Job 38:9) During the first “day,” this barrier began to clear, allowing diffused light to penetrate the atmosphere. *

On the second “day,” the atmosphere evidently continued to clear, creating a space between the thick clouds above and the ocean below. On the fourth “day,” the atmosphere gradually cleared to such an extent that the sun and the moon were made to appear “in the expanse of the heavens.” (Genesis 1:14-16) In other words, from the perspective of a person on earth, the sun and moon began to be discernible. These events happened gradually.

The Genesis account also relates that as the atmosphere continued to clear, flying creatures — including insects and membrane-winged creatures— started to appear on the fifth “day.”

The Bible's narrative allows for the possibility that some major events during each day, or creative period, occurred gradually rather than instantly, perhaps some of them even lasting into the following creative days. *

* Footnote: For example, during the sixth creative day, God decreed that humans "become many and fill the earth." (Genesis 1:28, 31) Yet, this event did not even begin to occur until the following "day." —Genesis 2:2."